

Replica Symmetry Breaking Instability in the 2D XY model in a random field

Pierre Le Doussal

Laboratoire de Physique Théorique de l'Ecole Normale Supérieure, 24 Rue Lhomond, F-75231 Paris Cedex, France¹

Thierry Giamarchi

Laboratoire de Physique des Solides, Université Paris-Sud, Bât. 510, 91405 Orsay, France²

Abstract

We study the 2D vortex-free XY model in a random field, a model for randomly pinned flux lines in a plane. We construct controlled RG recursion relations which allow for replica symmetry breaking (RSB). The fixed point previously found by Cardy and Ostlund in the glass phase $T < T_c$ is *unstable* to RSB. The susceptibility χ associated to infinitesimal RSB perturbation in the high-temperature phase is found to diverge as $\chi \propto (T - T_c)^{-\gamma}$ when $T \rightarrow T_c^+$. This provides analytical evidence that RSB occurs in finite dimensional models. The physical consequences for the glass phase are discussed.

One of the most fruitful methods to study disordered systems is the replica method [3] which allows to average over disorder by introducing n coupled copies of the system. Since it reduces the problem to a translationally invariant system this method has the considerable advantage, in principle, to allow the use of standard field theory techniques. However the limit $n \rightarrow 0$ has to be taken, a rather subtle procedure. Indeed, as is well known from the large body of works on spin glasses [4] the free energy functional is in general minimized, in a glass phase, by a solution which breaks replica symmetry spontaneously, in the hierarchical manner discovered by Parisi [5]. Up to now, however, spontaneous replica symmetry breaking (RSB) has been clearly demonstrated only when a saddle point method could be used naturally. This is the case either in infinite-range or mean field models where the saddle point method provides the exact solution of the problem and RSB is ubiquitous [6], or, as found more recently [7], in field theories using a Hartree or Gaussian variational method (GVM) which becomes exact in the limit of large number of components, in some as yet unelucidated sense. As explicitly constructed in both cases the physics of RSB corresponds to systems breaking up in many “states” [6]. Extensions of RSB to finite dimensional systems for which such mean-field theory is not exact have been attempted [8]. However, it is far from obvious, as argued in [9], that it is relevant in real, i.e low dimensional physical systems.

Another extensively tried method for these problems is the renormalization group (RG). There replicas have been used so far simply as a graph counting trick, to eliminate disconnected graphs in perturbation theory [10]. This procedure, however, implicitly assumes replica symmetry before taking the limit $n \rightarrow 0$. Although the RG treats fluctuations exactly and is therefore more accurate than mean field theory, there is a risk that it will miss the physics associated to RSB. Thus one would like to link the two methods.

A good model to look for a renormalization group that allows RSB is the two dimensional XY model in a random field and without vortices (i.e with spins $S(x) = e^{i\psi(x)}$ where $\psi(x)$ is real-valued in $[-\infty, \infty]$). This model is particularly interesting because it is one of the simplest and non trivial models of a “glass” in finite dimension, to which several analytical methods can be applied [11–16]. It is relevant to describe several physical disordered systems, such as randomly pinned flux arrays confined to a plane [17,18,15], the surface of crystals with quenched bulk or substrate disorder [19], planar Josephson junctions [20], domain walls in incommensurate solids. In a pioneering work [12], Cardy and Ostlund (CO) studied this model using the renormalization group. They used the replica method and introduced n coupled XY models which they mapped onto a Coulomb gas with $n(n-1)/2$ types of vector charges. They constructed the corresponding RG equations and performed the limit $n \rightarrow 0$ in these equations, thus implicitly assuming replica symmetry. The resulting RG recursion relations, valid near T_c , possess a non-trivial perturbative fixed point for $T < T_c$ at weak disorder strength $g = g^* \propto T_c - T$. CO concluded that a “glass” phase exists, controlled by this new fixed point. In this phase, one coupling constant is found to runaway to infinity, a somewhat peculiar feature. These results were extended in [19,21], and the disorder averaged correlation function $C(x) = \overline{\langle \psi(x) - \psi(0) \rangle^2}$ was found to grow as $C(x) \sim B(\log|x|)^2$, faster than $C(x) \sim T \log|x|$ which holds in the high temperature phase and for the pure system.

Although there is presently agreement that a glass phase exists in this model for $T < T_c$ its physical properties remain controversial, despite the large number of analytical and numerical studies. Two recent numerical simulations [22,23] have shown somewhat puzzling

results which shed some doubt on the Cardy Ostlund RG. Both simulations were found incompatible with the $C(x) \sim B(\log|x|)^2$ prediction. In the dynamics [22] it was found that the velocity develops a non linear dependence on the driving force for $T < T_c$, providing evidence of a glassy phase, but with an exponent inconsistent with the prediction of a conventional dynamic RG study [13].

These simulations, however, seem compatible with our previous analytical results using the Gaussian variational method [15,16]. We found that a one-step replica symmetry broken solution described the glass phase $T < T_c$ with $C(x) \sim T_c \log|x|$ at variance with the result of CO, while $C(x) \sim T \log|x|$ for $T > T_c$. Such a discontinuity in the slope was observed in [23]. The simulation [22] was performed at such weak disorder that the system size was shorter than the length predicted by the GVM [15] beyond which glassy behavior can be observed in static quantities. One can argue that a variational method, such as the GVM, is approximate even in pure systems and misses some of the effects of non linearities better captured by the renormalization group. On the other hand, this solution contains the feature of RSB and its compatibility with numerical calculations suggests that it has some relevance for the physics. Thus, it would be quite interesting to have a direct evidence, in the present model, that spontaneous RSB do occur.

In this paper we present such an evidence. We construct renormalization group recursion relations, for the random field XY model, for couplings between replicas of arbitrary symmetry. It contains the Cardy Ostlund recursion relations as a particular case. It allows for a more general way of taking the limit $n \rightarrow 0$, using Parisi's type matrices, while remaining in the perturbative regime of the renormalization group. The new operators introduced in the limit $n \rightarrow 0$ are marginally relevant at $T = T_c$ and thus can be incorporated in the framework of RG. We show that the low temperature phase does exhibit spontaneous RSB. In the high-temperature phase where the RG flows to weak coupling and is therefore certainly correct, we compute the linear response to a small RSB perturbation. The associated susceptibility diverges at the transition as $\chi \propto (T - T_c)^{-\gamma}$ when $T \rightarrow T_c^+$. For $T < T_c$ the replica symmetric flow and the CO fixed point, are unstable to a small RSB. This is to our knowledge the first physical model where this effect can be demonstrated in a controlled way.

The Hamiltonian of the 2D vortex-free XY model in a field of random amplitude and direction, reads:

$$H = \int d^2x \frac{c}{2} (\nabla\psi(x))^2 - \eta(x) \cdot \nabla\psi(x) - \zeta_1(x) \cos(\psi(x)) - \zeta_2(x) \sin(\psi(x)) \quad (1)$$

with $\overline{\eta_i(x)\eta_j(x')} = \Delta_0 \delta_{ij} \delta(x - x')$ and $\overline{\zeta_i(x)\zeta_j(x')} = \Delta \delta_{ij} \delta(x - x')$ are two Gaussian white noises. This model also describes flux lines with displacements u and average spacing a in $d = 1 + 1$ dimensions, with $\psi = 2\pi u/a$. Δ is proportional to the amplitude of disorder with Fourier component close to $2\pi/a$ and Δ_0 is the long wavelength disorder. Note that Δ_0 is generated if not present originally in the model.

After replication of (1) and averaging one obtains:

$$\frac{H_{\text{eff}}}{T} = \int d^2x \sum_{ab} \left[\frac{K_{ab}^{-1}}{2\pi} \nabla\phi^a \nabla\phi^b - \frac{g_{ab}}{(2\pi)^2} \cos(2(\phi^a(x) - \phi^b(x))) \right] \quad (2)$$

where we set $g_{aa} = 0$. We have used for convenience:

$$K_{ab}^{-1} = \frac{4\pi c}{T} \delta_{ab} - \frac{4\pi \Delta_0}{T^2}, \quad \frac{g_{ab}}{(2\pi)^2} = \frac{\Delta}{2T^2} \quad (3)$$

and $\phi^a = \psi^a/2$. This defines the “bare” or starting values parameters, which of course are replica symmetric. We now consider a more general situation where the “renormalized” parameters K_{ab} and g_{ab} have arbitrary symmetry with respect to the group of replica permutation. We use the parameterization:

$$K_{ab}^{-1} = \delta_{ab} - k_{ab} \quad (4)$$

One defines the connected part $k_c = \sum_b k_{ab}$. As will be obvious later there is a transition at temperature $T_c = 4\pi c$ in the model (1). Using (3) and (4) this corresponds to $k_c = 0$, and one has more generally $k_c = \frac{T-T_c}{T} = \tau$, where τ is the reduced temperature.

In previous applications of RG to disordered systems, recursion relations are established for arbitrary number n of replica. Then replica symmetry is assumed and the RG equations become simple functions of n . The continuation $n \rightarrow 0$ is then easily taken. In that respect the use of replica is a trick of graph counting. In fact one can generally establish identical RG equations directly by considering disorder propagators, a method which we call “replica symmetric perturbation theory”. However, in a glassy system, where many metastable states exist, one can question the validity of such a renormalization group procedure. A crucial assumption of the RG is that one can simply integrate over the short scale degrees of freedom independently of the larger scales, to produce an equivalent renormalized Hamiltonian. It is not obvious that such a separation between scales exists in glassy systems. Short scale degrees of freedom may well be determined by the local minimum they belong to, thus depend in effect on larger scales. The presence of long range effects is supported by the massless modes found in the expansions around Parisi’s solution [8]. However, the replicated Hamiltonian is translationally invariant and all these problems are buried in the proper taking of the limit $n \rightarrow 0$. In the case where the standard replica symmetric limit $n \rightarrow 0$ does not work, a Parisi type RSB might allow to construct a correct RG for glassy systems. We will therefore construct RG equations keeping the full matrix structure of the couplings. Since we are looking for a scale invariant theory *near the transition*, we consider perturbation theory in τ , in the small matrix parameters $2k_{ab} - k_{aa} - k_{bb}$ and in g_{ab} . This leaves unconstrained the degree of freedom of a constant shift of all the elements of k_{ab} . K_{ab}^{-1} is easily inverted as $K_{ab} = (1 - k_c)^{-2}[(1 - 2k_c)\delta_{ab} + k_{ab}] \simeq \delta_{ab} + k_{ab}$, which is valid even if the k_{ab} are large provided the above-mentioned parameters are small.

The constants g_{ab} , k_{ab} and $k_c = \tau$ correspond to quadratic interactions in an equivalent fermion problem [24]. Using standard renormalization group methods, either on the fermion form or on the classical Hamiltonian (2) [24], one can derive to second order the general RG for the replicated system

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{dg_{ab}}{dl} &= (2k_{ab} - k_{aa} - k_{bb})g_{ab} + \frac{1}{2} \sum_{c \neq a,b} g_{ac}g_{bc} \\ \frac{dk_{ab}}{dl} &= \frac{1}{4}g_{ab}^2, \quad \frac{d\tau}{dl} = 0 \end{aligned} \quad (5)$$

where l is the standard logarithmic scale. In these equations $a \neq b$ is implied. Note that the reduced temperature τ is unrenormalized. The subspace of replica-symmetric parameters $g_{ab} = g$, $k_{a \neq b} = k$ is obviously preserved by the RG and the equations (5) for g , k and τ reduce to the one obtained by Cardy and Ostlund in the limit $n = 0$:

$$\frac{dg}{dl} = -2\tau g - g^2, \quad \frac{dk}{dl} = \frac{1}{4}g^2 \quad (6)$$

In the high temperature phase, $\tau > 0$, the disorder g is irrelevant and the fixed point is a pure Gaussian system with $C(x) = \overline{\langle \phi(x) - \phi(0) \rangle^2} \sim (\frac{T}{T_c} + O(g)) \log |x|$. The renormalization of the off-diagonal part k contributes to $O(g)$ since k goes to a constant (which stays finite up to $\tau = 0$). In the low temperature phase, there is a fixed point at $g^* = 2|\tau|$. Note however that k flows to infinity. This is a peculiar situation which within the replica symmetric scheme does not lead to inconsistencies, since k does not feedback to any order in perturbation theory (only averages $\overline{(\sum_a C_a \phi_a)^2}$ with $\sum_a C_a = 0$ appear). The flow of k was used [19] to predict $C(x) \sim B(\log |x|)^2$.

Let us now look at the RG flow for coupling constants parameterized by Parisi matrices. g_{ab} and k_{ab} , $a \neq b$ are replaced by functions $g(u)$, $k(u)$, with $0 < u < 1$. The symmetric case corresponds to constant functions. The independent variables are now τ , $g(u)$ and $k(u)$. The equations now read:

$$\frac{dg(u)}{dl} = (-2\tau + 2(k(u) - \langle k \rangle))g(u) - \langle g \rangle g(u) - \frac{1}{2} \int_0^u dv (g(v) - g(u))^2, \quad \frac{dk(u)}{dl} = \frac{1}{4}g(u)^2 \quad (7)$$

where $\langle k \rangle = \int_0^1 dv k(v)$. These functions depend on l but this will be written explicitly only when needed. Some features are immediately apparent on (7). There is now a spectrum of dimensions, given by $-\tau + k(u) - \langle k \rangle$, for the operators corresponding to the non replica symmetric couplings g_{ab} . The dimension of these operators should be small to neglect the effect of higher order replica terms. Also $k(u)$ now feeds back in the equation for $g(u)$, thus one anticipates an instability.

Let us first check the stability of the replica symmetric flow in the low temperature phase. We separate the replica symmetric part and write $g(u) = g_l + \epsilon(u)$ and $k(u) = k_l + A(u)$ with $\langle \epsilon \rangle = 0$ and $\langle A \rangle = 0$. Starting from the CO fixed point $g = g^*$, k_l being the running coupling constant when $g = g^*$, one obtains from (7) the deviations from the replica symmetric solution to linear order:

$$\frac{d\epsilon(u)}{dl} = 2g^* A(u), \quad \frac{dA(u)}{dl} = \frac{g^*}{2} \epsilon(u) \quad (8)$$

Thus the RG flow is clearly *unstable* to replica symmetry breaking when $\tau < 0$. The eigenvalue of instability is $\lambda = 2|\tau|$. When $\tau < 0$ there is no small coupling fixed point and the flow goes to strong coupling [25]. This is clear from (7) since $A(u)$ can only reach a fixed point if $g^2(u) - \langle g^2 \rangle$ goes to zero. This is a strong indication that the low temperature phase corresponds to a replica symmetry broken solution. To conclude unambiguously on that issue, we now consider the high temperature phase $\tau > 0$ where the RG is exact since there is a weak coupling fixed point $g(u) = 0$ (and $A(u)$ small). By computing the linear susceptibility to small RSB perturbation we show that spontaneous RSB occurs at T_c .

Let us define the susceptibility to RSB as follows. We start, for $\tau > 0$ with a given disorder g_0 and add a small RSB perturbation $g(u) = g_0 + \epsilon_0(u)$ uniform in space. This will result in replica non symmetric part in the correlation functions $\langle \phi_a(q)\phi_b(-q) \rangle = (\delta_{ab} + k_{ab}^*)/q^2$ where k_{ab}^* are the renormalized coupling at the fixed point $g(u) = 0$. A susceptibility is defined as:

$$A^*(u) \equiv k^*(u) - \langle k^* \rangle = \chi \epsilon_0(u) \quad (9)$$

in the limit $\epsilon_0 \rightarrow 0$. One should consider a χ function of u but it turns out that it has the above simple form. Alternatively, one can add a quadratic RSB perturbation $\delta k_{ab} \nabla \phi_a \nabla \phi_b$ and define a corresponding susceptibility χ' as in (9). To compute χ let us expand the RG equations (7) to linear order in ϵ_0 . As can be seen from (7), A can be considered as linear in ϵ_0 .

$$\begin{aligned} \frac{dg}{dl} &= -2\tau g - g^2, & \frac{dA(u)}{dl} &= \frac{1}{2}g\epsilon(u) \\ \frac{d\epsilon(u)}{dl} &= -(2\tau + g)\epsilon(u) + 2gA(u) \end{aligned} \quad (10)$$

At linear order, each u can be treated independently. We perform the following rescalings $x = 2\tau l$, $\epsilon(u) = \epsilon_0(u)f$, $A(u) = \epsilon_0(u)a$, $g = 2\tau\tilde{g}$. The first equation of (10) integrates to give $\tilde{g}(x) = \frac{e^{-x}}{\alpha+1-e^{-x}}$ where we have defined $\alpha = 2\tau/g_0$. Defining $Z(x) = \frac{2}{\alpha} \int_0^x dy A(y) + 1$, (10) gives $f(x) = \alpha e^{-x} Z(x) / (\alpha + 1 - e^{-x})$ where $Z(x)$ satisfies:

$$\frac{d^2 Z}{dx^2} = Z(x) e^{-2x} / (\alpha + 1 - e^{-x})^2 \quad (11)$$

with initial conditions, $Z(0) = 1$ and $Z'(0) = 0$. The problem depends thus only on one variable $\alpha = 2\tau/g_0$. The susceptibility is obtained from the asymptotic value A_∞ and is $\chi = \lim_{x \rightarrow \infty} \alpha Z'(x)/2$.

A full solution of (11) can be obtained numerically, but χ can be estimated from considering the two asymptotic regimes $\alpha \gg 1$ and $\alpha \ll 1$. In the first regime $\alpha \gg 1$, (11) becomes $Z''(x) = e^{-2x} Z(x) / \alpha^2$, whose solution is in terms of Bessel functions, $Z(x) = c_1 I_0(e^{-x}/\alpha) + c_2 K_0(e^{-x}/\alpha)$. $c_{1,2}$ are two constants determined from the initial conditions. This gives in that regime:

$$\chi = \frac{1}{2} I_1\left(\frac{g_0}{2\tau}\right) \sim \frac{g_0}{8\tau} \quad (12)$$

To investigate the behavior close to the transition one has to look at $\alpha \ll 1$ and to match two regimes in x . For $x \ll 1$, (11) can be written $Z''(x) = Z(x) / (\alpha + x)^2$ whose solution are power laws $Z \propto (\alpha + x)^{-\nu}$ where ν satisfies the golden mean equation $\nu^2 + \nu = 1$. We define $\gamma = (\sqrt{5} - 1)/2 \simeq 0.618$. The solution is $Z(x) = ((1 + x/\alpha)^{-\gamma} + \gamma^2(1 + x/\alpha)^{1/\gamma}) / (1 + \gamma^2)$. When x becomes of order 1, one can use the equation of the first regime with $\alpha \rightarrow \alpha + 1$. A simple matching at $x \approx 1$ gives:

$$\chi \propto C(g_0/2\tau)^\gamma \quad (13)$$

We performed a numerical integration of (11) which confirms the analytic estimates (12,13) and gives $C \approx 0.165$. χ' can be computed similarly from (11), with modified initial conditions $Z(0) = 0$ and $Z'(0) = 2/\alpha$ and has the same divergence as χ . There is also a non linear response in ϵ_0 in the high temperature phase. A runaway flow occurs for smaller and smaller values of ϵ_0 when $\tau \rightarrow 0$, roughly when $\chi\epsilon_0 > \tau$.

The divergence of χ in (13) when $\tau \rightarrow 0$ fixed g_0 shows that RSB occurs spontaneously [26] for $\tau \leq 0$. Quantities like $\langle \phi_a(q)\phi_b(-q) \rangle$ acquire a replica non symmetric part. Defining $q_{ab} = \langle \nabla \phi_a(x) \nabla \phi_b(x) \rangle$, a possible order parameter for RSB is $Q_{ab} = 2q_{ab} + \sum_{c \neq a} q_{ac} + \sum_{c \neq b} q_{bc}$. The perturbation δk_{ab} is the conjugated field to Q_{ab} . Thus χ' is the inverse effective mass of Q_{ab} , and its divergence signals an instability à la de Almeida Thouless [27] when $T \leq T_c$. By analogy with the sine Gordon model, a reasonable interpretation of the runaway flow of g_{ab} is that a “mass” develops for some modes below T_c . This scenario is in good agreement with the findings of the variational method [15,16], where correlation functions become non replica symmetric and a fraction $1 - u_c$ of the modes become massive below T_c , with $u_c \approx T/T_c$. These modes correspond, in the Coulomb gas, to types of charges which unbind. Note that a fraction u_c remains massless (corresponding to bound types of charges). This method, being non perturbative contrary to RG, allows for the generation of a mass.

In this paper, we have shown that replica symmetry breaking can be incorporated in the RG. We found new relevant operators which break replica symmetry when $n \rightarrow 0$ for $T \leq T_c$. The associated susceptibility diverges in the high temperature phase $T > T_c$. The replica symmetric fixed point found by Cardy Ostlund is unstable. Observable consequences of RSB could be looked for in the dynamics of this system. RSB is usually accompanied by effects of aging, persistent correlations, and breaking of fluctuation dissipation theorem [28]. In our opinion it is also probable that the static correlation functions should be different from the one predicted by the symmetric RG, as hinted at by the variational method. Further numerical and experimental results would be of great interest.

We are grateful to E. Brezin, M. Gabay, T. Hwa and Y. Shapir for useful discussions.

REFERENCES

- [1] Laboratoire Propre du CNRS, associé à l'Ecole Normale Supérieure et à l'Université Paris-Sud, electronic address: ledou@physique.ens.fr
- [2] Laboratoire associé au CNRS, electronic address: giam@lps.u-psud.fr
- [3] S. F. Edwards and P. W. Anderson, J. Phys. F **5**, 965 (1975).
- [4] For a review see K. Binder, A. P. Young, Rev. Mod. Phys. **58** 801 (1986).
- [5] G. Parisi, J. Phys. A **13**, 1101 (1980).
- [6] M. Mezard, G. Parisi, and M. A. Virasoro, *Spin Glass Theory and beyond* (World Scientific, Singapore, 1987).
- [7] M. Mezard and G. Parisi, J. de Phys. I **4**, 809 (1991).
- [8] C. De Dominicis and I. Kondor, J. Phys. A **22**, L743 (1989) and Phys. Rev. B **27**, 606 (1983).
- [9] D. S. Fisher and D. A. Huse, Phys. Rev. B **38**, 386 (1988).
- [10] See for instance T. C. Lubensky in *Ill Condensed Matter*, Les Houches Proceedings, R. Balian, R. Maynard and G. Toulouse, Editors, North Holland (1978).
- [11] J. Villain and J. Fernandez, Z Phys. B **54**, 139 (1984).
- [12] J. Cardy and S. Ostlund, Phys. Rev. B **25**, 6899 (1982).
- [13] Y. Y. Goldschmidt and B. Schaub, Nucl. Phys. B **251**, 77 (1985); Y. C. Tsai and Y. Shapir, Phys. Rev. Lett. **69**, 1773 (1992).
- [14] L. Balents and M. Kardar, Nucl. Phys. B **393**, 481 (1993).
- [15] T. Giamarchi and P. Le Doussal, Phys. Rev. Lett. **72**, 1530 (1994), and to be published.
- [16] S. E. Korshunov, Phys. Rev. B **48**, 3969 (1993).
- [17] M. P. A. Fisher, Phys. Rev. Lett. **62**, 1415 (1989).
- [18] T. Nattermann, I. Lyuksyutov, and M. Schwartz, Europhys. Lett. **16**, 295 (1991).
- [19] J. Toner and D. DiVincenzo, Phys. Rev. B **41**, 632 (1990).
- [20] V. M. Vinokur and A. E. Koshelev, Sov. Phys. JETP **70**, 547 (1990).
- [21] T. Hwa and D. S. Fisher, Phys. Rev. Lett. **72**, 2466 (1994).
- [22] G. G. Batrouni and T. Hwa, Phys. Rev. Lett. **72**, 4133 (1994).
- [23] D. Cule and Y. Shapir, preprint(1994).
- [24] J. Sólyom, Adv. Phys. **28**, 209 (1979); D. R. Nelson and B. I. Halperin, Phys. Rev. B **19**, 2457 (1979).
- [25] A RSB coupling fixed point perturbative in g_{ab} could be accessible if higher orders in K_{ab} are included.
- [26] Note that the susceptibility associated to replica *symmetric* perturbations does not diverge.
- [27] J. R. L. de Almeida and D. J. Thouless, J. Phys. A **11**, 983 (1978).
- [28] H. Sompolinsky and A. Zippelius, Phys. Rev. B **25**, 6860 (1982); V. S. Dotsenko, M. V. Feigelman, and L. B. Ioffe, Sov. Sci. Rev. A. Phys **15**, 1 (1990); S. Franz and M. Mezard, Physica **209**, 00 (1994); A. Crisanti, H. Horner, and H. J. Sommers, Z Phys. B **92**, 257 (1993).